

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 VILLAGE OF GREENPORT
3 COUNTY OF SUFFOLK: STATE OF NEW YORK

-----X

4 HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

5 REGULAR MEETING

6 -----X

7 November 6, 2017
8 5:03 p.m.

9 Third Street Fire Station
10 Greenport, New York

11 MINUTES

12
13 BEFORE: STEVEN BULL, Chairman

14 ROSELLE BORRELLI, Member

15 DENNIS McMAHON, Member

16 CAROLINE WALOSKI, Member (Absent)

17 SUSAN WETSELL, Member (Absent)

18
19 ALSO PRESENT:

20 KRISTINA LINGG, Building Department Clerk

21 EILEEN WINGATE, Building Inspector

22
23
24 Donna L. Ritzmann, Court Reporter

25

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 INDEX

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
1	502 Carpenter Street, discussion and possible motion on the application submitted by 502 Carpenter Street, LLC. The applicant is proposing the addition of a porch, SCTM #1001-3-5-1.2	4-11
2	837 Main Street, discussion and possible motion on the application submitted by John Sampogna. The applicant is proposing to construct a pool in the rear yard and is also proposing to construct a fence, SCTM 1001-2-1-19.1	11-21
3	440 First Street, continued discussion and possible motion on the application submitted by Eric Urban. The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing porch on the south side of the residence. HPC members have requested that there be a site visit for HPC members at four p.m. on November 6th, 2017. SCTM 1001-4-7-1	21-34

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 INDEX (Continued)

3 ITEM DESCRIPTION PAGE

4 4 434 Main Street, discussion and
5 possible motion regarding the Village of
6 Greenport Historic Preservation Commission
7 co-nomination (with the Society for the
8 Preservation of Long Island) to add the
9 Greenport Auditorium (at 434 Main Street) to
10 the Preservation League of New York State's
11 2018 "Seven to Save" endangered properties
12 list. This is SCTM 1001-4-7-25. 34-40

13
14 5 Motion to accept the minutes of the
15 September 11 and October 2, 2017
16 meetings 40-40

17
18 6 Motion to schedule the next HPC meeting
19 for 5:00 p.m. on December 4, 2017, at the
20 Third Street Fire Station 41-41

21
22 7 Motion to adjourn 42-42

23

24

25

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Ladies and
3 gentlemen. This is the November 6th, 2017
4 meeting of the Village of Greenport Historic
5 Preservation Commission. My name is Steven
6 Bull. I'm the chairman. And on my right I
7 have?

8 MR. McMAHON: Dennis McMahon.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: And on my left?

10 MS. BORRELLI: Roselle Borrelli.

11 THE CHAIRMAN: So this meeting is
12 now off to starting with Item Number One,
13 502 Carpenter Street. It's a discussion and
14 possible motion on the application submitted
15 by 502 Carpenter Street, LLC. The applicant
16 is proposing the addition of a porch. Is the
17 applicant here?

18 MS. WINGATE: This is the third
19 month he's not here, so you have options to
20 not accept the application or make a decision
21 without being able to answer questions.

22 MR. McMAHON: Are there drawings?

23 MS. LINGG: You had that the last
24 time.

25 MS. WINGATE: Yeah, it was last

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 time.

3 THE CHAIRMAN: There is this page
4 here and there's paperwork (Referring).

5 MS. WINGATE: There's drawings,
6 there's full sets of drawings.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: Oh, yes. I have a
8 full set of drawings from last time I think.

9 MS. WINGATE: From last time.

10 MS. BORRELLI: Yes.

11 THE CHAIRMAN: Here we go.

12 (Perusing) So I guess this must be the porch
13 (Referring), that's the porch.

14 MR. McMAHON: This is the corner of
15 Ludlam and Carpenter Street?

16 MS. WINGATE: Yes, it is.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah, we already
18 approved the original drawings for this house
19 and all the details. I believe this back
20 porch was not included at the time, I think
21 there was maybe a little gray issues and I
22 think they just wanted to take the time to
23 make sure that that's what they wanted.

24 MR. McMAHON: This is perfect, I've
25 seen this.

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 MS. WINGATE: Can you speak into
3 the microphone?

4 MR. McMAHON: I'm sorry. I
5 understand this house very well. I lived next
6 door two or three years. And this is a
7 secondary entryway off of Ludlam. As far as
8 I'm concerned that's adequate for me anyway,
9 if you choose to go over there and take a look
10 at it yourself, I understand the house. I've
11 seen what they've been doing. They've been
12 doing a real bang up job on it, so. I have
13 every --

14 MR. INGA: Hi, how are you?

15 MS. WINGATE: He's here to talk
16 about this house.

17 MR. McMAHON: This house,
18 fantastic.

19 THE CHAIRMAN: Oh. So please step
20 up to the podium. Introduce yourself and talk
21 about this house.

22 Is that the house we're talking
23 about?

24 MS. WINGATE: Yes.

25 MR. McMAHON: Is this the porch?

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 MS. WINGATE: Speak into the
3 microphone and introduce yourself so that she
4 can --

5 MS. MOORE: I speak Spanish if you
6 need extra help.

7 MR. INGA: Yeah. Okay.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So please
9 what's your name and where do you live?

10 MR. INGA: I live in Shirley. My
11 name is Johnny I-N-G-A.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So Johnny, we
13 understand that this porch here is the porch
14 that you're here to talk about?

15 MR. INGA: Yes.

16 THE CHAIRMAN: And I think we've
17 heard already that you've been working, doing
18 other work on the house, there's a front porch
19 or another porch --

20 MR. INGA: Yeah.

21 THE CHAIRMAN: -- that's finished.

22 MR. INGA: Same house in the front.

23 THE CHAIRMAN: Same house, but this
24 is a back porch?

25 MR. INGA: For there.

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 THE CHAIRMAN: And it will be
3 finished in the same way as the front porch in
4 the same manner?

5 MR. McMAHON: The same wood, the
6 same --

7 MR. INGA: Yes, with the exterior
8 wood.

9 MR. McMAHON: Yes.

10 MR. INGA: Mm-hmm.

11 MR. McMAHON: Okay. Yes, I know
12 this house because I lived next door to this
13 house years ago, so I've been watching all the
14 work that you've been doing. Everything looks
15 very nice.

16 MR. INGA: Okay.

17 MR. McMAHON: So this is the side
18 porch facing towards Ludlam Street?

19 MR. INGA: Okay.

20 MR. McMAHON: Yes?

21 MR. INGA: Yes.

22 MS. WINGATE: Yes.

23 MR. McMAHON: That's it.

24 THE CHAIRMAN: That's it.

25 MR. McMAHON: I understand, and

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 it's going to be the same material as you used
3 for the front porch, same wood, same
4 ballasters, the same rail system?

5 MR. INGA: Yes, and the trim is
6 going to be Versatex.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: That's fine, we
8 accept Versatex. So the trim is Versatex and
9 the rest of the finishings of the porch will
10 be in wood and in a similar feel to the front
11 porch of the house?

12 MR. INGA: Yes.

13 MR. McMAHON: Same rail system?

14 MR. INGA: Same railings and same
15 steps, Mahogany.

16 MR. McMAHON: Okay. Good. Good.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So I make a
18 motion to approve this rear porch presented in
19 this plan, that it will match in the feeling
20 and materials to the front porch of the house,
21 certain trim and Versatex and that we approve
22 this application for --

23 MS. BORRELLI: Can I just ask him
24 one question?

25 THE CHAIRMAN: Oh, please.

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 MS. BORRELLI: (Speaking in
3 Spanish). I just wanted to verify it was all
4 in the same --

5 MS. WINGATE: Roselle, we can't do
6 this.

7 MS. BORRELLI -- it was all done in
8 the same fashion and all the materials are
9 going to be the same. He's already -- I was
10 just concerned that he's the guy that did the
11 other stuff because it's really a beautifully
12 done job.

13 MR. INGA: Thank you.

14 MS. BORRELLI: Very beautifully
15 done.

16 MR. INGA: Thank you very much.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: So the translation
18 is that?

19 MS. BORRELLI: Everything is going
20 to be done within the same fashion. He is the
21 gentleman that did everything else. And it's
22 gonna be beautiful, I suppose.

23 MR. McMAHON: Okay. I will second
24 the motion.

25 THE CHAIRMAN: All in favor?

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 MS. BORRELLI: Aye.

3 MR. McMAHON: Aye.

4 THE CHAIRMAN: Aye.

5 MR. INGA: Thank you.

6 MR. McMAHON: Thank you.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

8 MR. INGA: That's it?

9 MR. McMAHON: That's it. Free to
10 go. That wasn't so hard.

11 MS. WINGATE: That's not it. I
12 have to write the Building Permit, so you have
13 to come to the office next week and pickup the
14 permit.

15 MR. INGA: Next week when?

16 MS. WINGATE: Monday.

17 MR. INGA: Next week Monday, okay.

18 MS. WINGATE: Okay? You want it
19 sooner?

20 MR. INGA: No, it's fine.

21 MS. WINGATE: No. Okay. Good.

22 Thank you, John.

23 MR. INGA: Thank you very much.

24 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

25 Okay. The next item on the agenda

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 is Item Number Two, 837 Main Street,
3 discussion and possible motion on the
4 application submitted by John Sampogna. The
5 applicant is proposing to construct a pool in
6 the rear yard and is also proposing to
7 construct a fence, SCTM 1001-2-1-19.1.

8 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Hello.

9 MS. WINGATE: Introduce yourself.

10 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Oh, yeah. Hi, my
11 name is Bill. I am from Long Island Pool Care
12 Corporation in Southold. The homeowner's not
13 here, so I'm the contractor.

14 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.

15 MR. McMAHON: All good.

16 MS. BORRELLI: So the house is on
17 Main Street and the back of the house is on
18 Web Street.

19 THE CHAIRMAN: So we have a map of
20 the location, but we don't have any elevations
21 or other detail concerning the look and the
22 placement of the pool in what appears to be
23 the backyard. So can you talk to us a little
24 bit about the fence or are you here just to
25 talk about the pool?

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: No, I can talk
3 about the fence. What's going to be the
4 question? Okay. Well, there's privets
5 actually you saw that on the line, it's the
6 red line that goes in.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: Mm-hmm.

8 MR. McMAHON: Mm-hmm.

9 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: That's already
10 halfway through the privet hedges, so we're
11 going to put a chain link fence to hide it in
12 between, you know, right into the hedges.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: Uh-huh.

14 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: So four-feet
15 high.

16 THE CHAIRMAN: So the fence will be
17 chain link four-feet high imbedded in the
18 privet, does that encompass the entire border
19 of the fence; in other words, are there
20 portions of the chain link fence which will be
21 visible?

22 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Only section is
23 going to be visible by the gate. So it's got
24 a gate goes into the driveway, back of the
25 house.

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 THE CHAIRMAN: At the back of the
3 house?

4 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Yes.

5 THE CHAIRMAN: So can -- I don't
6 see it here on this drawing.

7 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Can I come over
8 there and show it to you?

9 THE CHAIRMAN: Please.

10 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: The gate is right
11 here (indicating).

12 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. And so what's
13 happening over here (Referring)?

14 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: There's nothing
15 on that side actually, it's all hedges. It is
16 all fence goes all the way around this way
17 (Indicating).

18 THE CHAIRMAN: So it will be
19 completely --

20 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: It's already got
21 an existing stockade fence, just got to put
22 the fence and hedges on this side
23 (Indicating).

24 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.

25 MS. BORRELLI: I have a question.

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Sure.

3 MS. BORRELLI: Maybe -- so this is
4 the house that sits on the corner of Main and
5 Web?

6 MS. WINGATE: No.

7 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: No.

8 MS. BORRELLI: No?

9 MS. WINGATE: This is halfway up
10 the middle, it's the house that was just done
11 blue. You --

12 MS. ANTONIADES: No, it's a cedar
13 house, it was just redone --

14 MS. WINGATE: It used to be blue,
15 that's right.

16 MS. ANTONIADES: -- dark gray
17 turned to cedar.

18 MS. WINGATE: I got it backwards.

19 MS. BORRELLI: Okay.

20 THE CHAIRMAN: I mean this --

21 MR. McMAHON: Not that it's a non
22 point, but it's a chain link fence within a
23 hedge and it's done quite often.

24 THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah. So I don't
25 think we have an issue with the hedge.

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 MR. McMAHON: I don't have an issue
3 with the hedge.

4 THE CHAIRMAN: But I'm wondering
5 what the issue is, is that we have in terms of
6 the addition of a pool.

7 MR. McMAHON: Mm-hmm.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: Because it's come up
9 before, a pool, in that case the pool was
10 visible from the street and the fence was an
11 issue, but we fixed that at that time, but do
12 we have -- what are our issues around having
13 the pool as a backyard since it looks like
14 there's a shed there as well?

15 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: There's no shed
16 there anymore, just the garage.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: Oh, okay. So the
18 shed has been removed?

19 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: The shed is
20 already removed, I never see the shed over
21 there, so.

22 THE CHAIRMAN: So are there any
23 other features that have been changed in this
24 backyard that we're not aware of that we don't
25 see here?

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Well, I have a
3 new plan, um...

4 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.

5 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: It's actually you
6 can see it better (Handing). Just the garage
7 here (Indicating). There's nothing in here
8 (Indicating), which I don't know what was done
9 before because I never aware. I was there
10 after everything was completed, everything was
11 done around the house.

12 MR. McMAHON: Okay. It's good.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: So do you have any
14 details to show us on the nature of the pool,
15 how the deck around the pool is going?

16 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: It's nothing
17 that's going to be around the pool. Elevation
18 of the pool is at the patio right here
19 (Indicating), so it's going to be the same
20 height as the patio because they're not
21 putting any patio around the pool, they plan
22 to put only 16 inches coupling around the pool.
23 They're gonna keep the grass all the way
24 around and all they have hedges all the way to
25 the front and this (Indicating), this is the

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 pool, kind of pretty much is invisible from
3 the street (Indicating).

4 MR. McMAHON: Mm-hmm.

5 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: They already have
6 privet hedges.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: But if the hedges
8 are four-foot high against the street then it
9 will be visible from the street?

10 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Yeah. The house
11 already four-feet higher than the street.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: Oh, okay. So where
13 is the pool equipment going?

14 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: (Referring) Right
15 behind the garage (Indicating).

16 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. But there's
17 not additional construction, there's just kind
18 of a mean to which holds the equipment?

19 MR. McMAHON: Just a pad.

20 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Just pretty much
21 the pad, the pump and filter is nothing.

22 THE CHAIRMAN: The pad, okay.

23 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: And you can put
24 dry well in here so just drainage
25 (Indicating).

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 THE CHAIRMAN: Oh, yeah, dry wells?

3 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Yeah.

4 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. For

5 maintenance purposes?

6 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Yes.

7 MR. McMAHON: I'm good.

8 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: No issues.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: So the pool

10 equipment goes there (Referring), dry well

11 (Referring), so that's not even at all

12 visible, this is a fence, chain link with a

13 four-foot hedge?

14 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Four-foot privet

15 hedges, yeah.

16 THE CHAIRMAN: Privet hedges. And

17 the hedges are not to exceed four feet in

18 height?

19 MS. WINGATE: Only in the front

20 yard, in the rear yard they could be as tall

21 as they want.

22 THE CHAIRMAN: As tall as they

23 want, okay. So then this hedge that I see

24 here is not in the -- it's not facing -- it's

25 not close enough, so this hedge here could be

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 at any height it wants to be (Indicating)?

3 MS. WINGATE: As long as it's 30-
4 feet from the front property line.

5 THE CHAIRMAN: Do we have any other
6 questions about this project?

7 MR. McMAHON: I'm all set.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: I make a motion that
9 we approve this pool as based on the new
10 drawings that we have received.

11 MS. BORRELLI: Are we approving a
12 pool or are we approving the fence?

13 THE CHAIRMAN: A fence and we have
14 the application of a pool because any of the
15 activities within this Historic District which
16 are a part of our consideration have overall
17 to do with not only what is visible from the
18 street, but the overall development of the
19 property itself. And now pools are not,
20 outdoor pools, are not a tradition in
21 Greenport, but they are things that people
22 add --

23 MR. McMAHON: That's right.

24 THE CHAIRMAN: -- to their houses,
25 so as long as there's nothing going on that

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 detracts from the building itself and that the
3 pool is built into the ground and it's, you
4 know, tastefully presented so that then I
5 don't believe we have a complaint to prevent a
6 person from having a pool.

7 MR. McMAHON: Okay.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: We have a pool, we
9 have a hedge that has an imbedded chain link
10 fence. I make a motion to approve the
11 application?

12 MR. McMAHON: I'll second the
13 motion.

14 THE CHAIRMAN: All in favor?

15 MS. BORRELLI: Aye.

16 MR. McMAHON: Aye.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Moving on.
18 Thank you (Handing).

19 MR. ALTINTOPRAK: Thank you.

20 THE CHAIRMAN: Item number three,
21 440 First Street, continued discussion and
22 possible motion on the application submitted
23 by Eric Urban. The applicant is proposing to
24 demolish the existing porch on the south side
25 of the residence. HPC members have requested

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 that there be a site visit for HPC members at
3 four p.m. on November 6th, 2017. The location
4 is SCTM 1001-4-7-1. And two of the members,
5 Dennis and myself, were at the 4:00 o'clock
6 site review with Eileen Wingate and Kristina.

7 So I see no reason why we should
8 allow the applicant to demolish the existing
9 porch because the porch is in good condition,
10 i mean good enough condition that it could be
11 repaired and made functional, more functional,
12 if construction is strong enough. It hasn't
13 been -- it seems it hasn't been maintained for
14 several years. There are other portions of
15 the porch which are in the front of the
16 property, it's -- this house is an important
17 part of the landscape of Greenport and our
18 mission is keeping this a historic
19 preservation. So I don't -- what do some of
20 the other people feel about this?

21 MR. McMAHON: Well, the point --
22 the point was the violation and the violation
23 was what prompted the demolition; is that
24 correct? So if we're not going to -- if it
25 doesn't have to be demolished, then that's the

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 request of your client is not to have to
3 demolish at this point.

4 MS. MOORE: Um, I think our
5 position was we were prepared to leave status
6 quo for now.

7 MR. McMAHON: That's correct.

8 MS. MOORE: Only to the extent that
9 if the village insists on the restoration of
10 that porch, it's cost prohibitive and,
11 therefore, our alternative would only be to
12 demolish it. And, for the record, we did
13 provide you at the meeting, and I'll make sure
14 you add it to your record, if not I have
15 additional photocopies, a 1935 photograph of
16 the house which shows the character, the look
17 of the house prior to the expansion of the
18 porch, the portico, the extension of the porch
19 on the street as well as that porch that is
20 the subject of this hearing -- of this
21 meeting. So there is a record that the porch
22 -- the house would still be characteristic of
23 the village if the porch was not there, and
24 that's what the record shows (Referring), but
25 we can keep things status quo. And at some

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 point if we have to come back, we will, but I
3 think realistically it's just cost
4 prohibitive, so whether it's now or later, I
5 think we're gonna be at the same point, so.

6 THE CHAIRMAN: So what -- so this
7 photograph was given to us at the meeting that
8 we had and it looks like the house and it was
9 of the date that there was a smaller porch on
10 the house. There are two things that
11 photograph doesn't quite show, which is the --
12 there are two trees that are there on the
13 property, which are almost heritage trees that
14 they're so important to the look of the house,
15 and in terms of even balancing the look of the
16 property, and so just as the existing porch
17 gives the property certain character, the
18 previous porch that was there also provided
19 the character. So as far as the demolition of
20 the existing porch, since -- with our visit it
21 was to check its structural integrity, it
22 still is strong enough. If the applicant
23 wishes in the future to do something about the
24 property, then it would be a new application
25 to either restore the porch as it once was or

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 to bring the current porch into -- or to
3 maintain the current porch by the best method
4 that they have that's available to them. So,
5 um, the importance of this property is that
6 we're able to keep the look and the feel in
7 the neighborhood. I think we're all in
8 agreement on that.

9 MS. BORRELLI: Mm-hmm.

10 MS. MOORE: Well, I would just
11 point out if you were to look across the
12 street at the two houses that are directly
13 across you will see almost mirror images of
14 this porch. Um, the directly across I think
15 Mr. Poles (phonetic), the previous owner --

16 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes, the house
17 across the street from this house, yes.

18 MS. MOORE: It has -- yup, it has a
19 very similar size porch and dimensionally
20 about the same except it now has a gingerbread
21 scroll, I don't know what it had before, and
22 then the house directly to the south of that
23 as well has a very similar size porch. And as
24 we were walking from the house over here we
25 noticed, we kinda pointed out to ourselves

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 that this 1930's look was very prominent in
3 the Village of Greenport. Many of the homes
4 seem to mirror this type of look, so, uh, the
5 porch that is there today while we, you know,
6 if we had endless amounts of money that might
7 not be an issue, but it seems to be actually a
8 little bit deviates from the general character
9 in the village. It was turned into a grand,
10 uh, structure, but it's original Barth house
11 looks like it was much more modest and in
12 keeping with the rest of the village.

13 MR. McMAHON: Yeah, I think we all
14 kind of agree on that. I don't know if
15 Roselle is taking note of the pictures, it's
16 totally in keeping with the house.

17 MS. MOORE: Mm-hmm.

18 MR. McMAHON: That's not really
19 what we're discussing at this point though.
20 It's if that was to be demolished, there would
21 have to be on record with the Building
22 Department plans, accurate plans to rebuild.

23 MS. MOORE: Oh, I see what you're
24 saying. So if we come back --

25 MR. McMAHON: Yeah.

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 MS. MOORE: -- and when he's ready
3 at some point.

4 MR. McMAHON: To do --

5 MS. MOORE: -- whether it is --

6 MR. McMAHON: To do that porch.

7 MS. MOORE: Got it. Okay. So the
8 next time, if we come back --

9 MR. McMAHON: Yeah.

10 MS. MOORE: -- and the choice at
11 that point for Mr. Irving will be either
12 you're gonna put the money to restore the
13 grand porch or get a Building Permit to cut it
14 back and make it --

15 MR. McMAHON: Recreate what was
16 there.

17 MS. MOORE: Recreate this
18 (Referring).

19 MR. McMAHON: Correct.

20 MS. MOORE: Okay. So that gives us
21 a little bit of guidance, I appreciate that
22 clarification.

23 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes, I believe that
24 is true, but I also point out that in this
25 photograph it appears that there's actually

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 the windows on the second floor open to a
3 balcony, which is above that porch, and you
4 can see the outline of a railing on that
5 porch, which is --

6 MR. McMAHON: Actually it was a
7 low -- it was low detail.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: It was a low detail?

9 MR. McMAHON: Yeah, it's a low
10 detail, it's not meant to be a balcony.

11 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay, but --

12 MS. MOORE: It's not meant to be --

13 MR. McMAHON: A lot of those
14 windows go down into the --

15 MS. MOORE: Yeah, but they were not
16 egress out to, they were just --

17 MR. McMAHON: Just swing out. My
18 house is the same way.

19 MS. MOORE: Right.

20 THE CHAIRMAN: So what we have here
21 is we have a porch that was added on which
22 establishes a certain familiar character of
23 the neighborhood that has become -- has made
24 this house particularly attractive to a number
25 of people who have walked by it and seen it

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 and encompassed that is the rest of the site,
3 which are the two trees. And if the applicant
4 comes back again, then they should be prepared
5 to come with detailed drawings either to
6 restore the porch as it once was, which is
7 from the, you know, photographs supplied by
8 the applicant, or restore the current porch to
9 its proper -- but that work should have been
10 annexed, if there is an application made for a
11 Building Permit, which just cannot -- I don't
12 think we should let this go untaken care of.
13 If we --

14 MS. MOORE: Well, we're not going
15 to -- at this point there's no money to
16 restore the -- that side porch.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah, understood.

18 MS. MOORE: So that wouldn't
19 happen.

20 THE CHAIRMAN: There's no money to
21 restore any porch that's there, not the front
22 nor the side.

23 MR. McMAHON: Yeah, it's a lot of
24 work.

25 MS. MOORE: Well, the front porch

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 is still intact, so it doesn't -- there's
3 really no need for any modifications to that
4 portion of the porch, if you cut off the part
5 that is on the south side --

6 THE CHAIRMAN: We disagree with
7 that statement, that the front porch is as in
8 bad repair or as need of maintenance as the
9 side porch.

10 MR. McMAHON: Yeah, it's not a
11 separate --

12 THE CHAIRMAN: The porch is the
13 porch, the existing porch that is there just
14 can't have one part whacked off and then I
15 think that the rest of it would be fine, it
16 needs maintenance.

17 MR. McMAHON: I thought that the
18 purpose here was to have basically permission
19 not to demo the porch at this time?

20 THE CHAIRMAN: Correct.

21 MS. MOORE: Okay.

22 MR. McMAHON: That's pretty much
23 it.

24 MS. MOORE: That's fine.

25 MR. McMAHON: And then, again, I

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 think if you want to reapply and maybe, for
3 instance, it's a very nice look to that house,
4 it's very original, those rolled columns,
5 romanesque or whatever they are --

6 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.

7 MR. McMAHON: -- don't really
8 belong --

9 THE REPORTER: Wait.

10 MS. WINGATE: Wait.

11 MR. McMAHON: It is the property.

12 MS. BORRELLI: I was just gonna say
13 I think they're Doric, Iconic or Corinthian, I
14 think --

15 MS. WINGATE: No, no, you've just
16 done every -- where is it? You've just listed
17 all the columns there are. They're Doric.

18 MS. BORRELLI: Yes, Doric.

19 MS. WINGATE: Oh, they have --
20 they're Iconic, they have scrolls.

21 MR. McMAHON: Scrolls, that's what
22 I said, you couldn't see it though.

23 MS. WINGATE: Right.

24 MS. BORRELLI: I mean I think if
25 you look at the footprint and you look at the

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 porch, it's the original porch of this photo
3 of the Barth house, it's fine. If you have
4 that porch it's very adequate to the house --

5 MR. McMAHON: Yeah.

6 MS. BORRELLI: -- it makes the
7 house look like any of the larger left
8 farmhouses and it's very pretty. If you look
9 at the porch that's there now, that porch with
10 it's Doric column or Corinthian columns and
11 the wide basis and that huge porch that wraps
12 around the side, it makes it majestic, it
13 makes it stand out and makes it different than
14 any other house in Greenport and is what gives
15 it its style and its beauty, so I don't know
16 why somebody would even consider wanting to
17 take that down to replace it with the more
18 farmhouse, but I mean that's, you know,
19 personal, it's not my house, I'm just saying
20 it doesn't seem like why would you do that?
21 It's the best porch. I've never seen a porch
22 like that. It just is what adds, like Dennis
23 said, it gives the house its elegance. It's
24 majestic, it's beautiful.

25 MS. MOORE: Well, if the village

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 finds money of some kind and it comes from the
3 sky or if Mr. Urban marries a very wealthy
4 woman, that's still an option, then we may be
5 back, so.

6 MR. McMAHON: And that was the
7 point.

8 MS. MOORE: Yeah.

9 MR. McMAHON: We have approved
10 general -- the lack --

11 MS. MOORE: No action on the house.

12 MR. McMAHON: No action on the
13 house.

14 MS. MOORE: Yes.

15 MR. McMAHON: If they reappear then
16 there should be proper drawings in regards to
17 its structural nature and also the restored
18 look.

19 THE CHAIRMAN: So on the
20 application, I make a motion that on the
21 application for demolition that we are denying
22 the application because of our meetings. And
23 that if the applicant returns to us that they
24 will either restore the grand porch as it is
25 now or they will make -- they will do a

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 restoration that matches the documentation
3 they sent, gave us as to how it once was. But
4 the porch is clearly in need of maintenance.

5 MR. McMAHON: Okay.

6 MS. MOORE: Thank you.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: All in favor?

8 MR. McMAHON: We are all in favor.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: Aye.

10 MR. McMAHON: Aye.

11 MS. BORRELLI: Aye.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.

13 MS. MOORE: So the notice of
14 violation will you take -- what are we gonna
15 do with that?

16 MS. WINGATE: I have to ponder
17 that.

18 MS. MOORE: Okay.

19 MS. WINGATE: I don't have an
20 answer for you this evening.

21 MS. MOORE: All right. We're not
22 in court yet. Off the record.

23 (Discussion held off the record.)

24 MS. MOORE: Thank you, Board.

25 THE CHAIRMAN: You're welcome.

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 Okay. Item number four, item
3 number four is about -- is 434 Main Street,
4 the discussion and possible motion regarding
5 the Village of Greenport Historic Preservation
6 Commission to co-nominate with the Society for
7 the Preservation of Long Island, known as
8 SPLIA, to add the Greenport Auditorium at
9 434 Main Street to the Preservation League of
10 New York State's 2018 "Seven to Save"
11 endangered properties list. This is SCTM
12 1001-4-7-25.

13 You have in front of you a letter
14 as well as the nomination itself which says
15 that -- which is the -- which is this
16 application or nomination. The nomination
17 proposes no obligation on the part of HPC
18 to -- or the Village of Greenport, so there's
19 no burden on the village, it's just a
20 nomination on the part. And it's a
21 co-nomination with SPLIA. So if you read the
22 nomination itself you'll see that most of
23 these elements are discussed as to the age and
24 the length of it. The fact that the property
25 really has only had two tenants, one tenant

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 was the original tenant that was using the
3 building as a hall to present culture to
4 Greenport. It is a building that has all of
5 its original components in place. It has a
6 stage that has -- in fact it has -- even has
7 the, uh, the footlight trays made out of metal
8 where they would burn limelight to light the
9 actors on stage. It has the fly space above
10 to pull up a curtain, so that -- with
11 abilities to add more backdrops. It has a
12 second -- it has a balcony which is in place
13 with all of its level changes. It has on the
14 main floor it has the complete seating there.
15 Many of the stained glass windows are
16 preserved. It even has the dressing rooms in
17 the basement and also in the basement are the
18 original seats. So, um, the nature of this
19 nomination is to bring state attention to this
20 asset and to develop some interest and
21 possible resources that gives this particular
22 owner some options going ahead and so that the
23 property itself does not go to -- into the
24 hands of developers who would otherwise put
25 something else in its place or make

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 alterations to the interior of the building
3 which would prevent it from having any future
4 as a theater space. So this nomination has
5 already been made. And subsequent to that I
6 got a letter, an email from Francis Gubler at
7 the preserve and New York State, which is the
8 Preservation Society, which is the
9 organization that actually -- the Preservation
10 League of New York State is the agency that's
11 responsible for designating the seven
12 structures of which we hope that this
13 Greenport auditorium will be one of them. And
14 they're interested in coming to Greenport in
15 December, perhaps in the first week of
16 December, perhaps at the end of the next
17 meeting of the HPC commission to make a
18 presentation for both Greenporters, other
19 nearby municipalities about some of the
20 options that are available in New York to get
21 technical assistance, grants or discover other
22 methods by which buildings that have a
23 historic interest can be saved and preserved
24 on the eastern end of Long Island, so it will
25 be both an inspection by the Preservation

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 Society of New York to leave, I believe,
3 preservation -- it will be both an inspection
4 by the Preservation League of New York State
5 to see the structure and make a presentation.
6 So I make a nomination, I think a nomination
7 -- I make a motion that we; one, approve this
8 path that would also allow us to have a time
9 in that first week of December and have this
10 presentation made by them. Bob?

11 MR. McMAHON: Second it.

12 MS. BORRELLI: Aye.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. All in favor?

14 MR. McMAHON: Aye.

15 THE CHAIRMAN: Aye.

16 MS. BORRELLI: Just one question,
17 I'm not sure if you do or not --

18 THE CHAIRMAN: What?

19 MS. BORRELLI: But once it's
20 restored to its original glory as an
21 auditorium and -- as an auditorium, correct?
22 Then Mr. O'Ricko (phonetic) is going to -- I
23 mean he's going to still be owner. He's not
24 looking to sell it. He wants to keep it as
25 owner to return it back to a theater; is

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 that it?

3 THE CHAIRMAN: Not necessarily.

4 The future of the structure or his ownership
5 would be determined in part by this nomination
6 and what the outcome would be. It might be
7 that there's a 501-C-3 that's for him to take
8 on this as a project.

9 MR. McMAHON: Mm-hmm.

10 THE CHAIRMAN: It might be that an
11 individual or a group of individuals want to
12 take this on as an enterprise, for profit
13 enterprise, and turn it into a proper theater
14 and buy this property, but the idea is to
15 hopefully find a way, a path, to preserve this
16 structure as a theater and continue to use it
17 as a theater and to plot the best -- the best
18 path forward so it doesn't -- because you'll
19 notice that in the page -- in the documents
20 that have come with this application there's
21 an article where the owner talks about his
22 need for different options.

23 MS. BORRELLI: Okay.

24 THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Okay.

25 MS. BORRELLI: Can I just put on

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 the record one thing on the auditorium?

3 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.

4 MS. BORRELLI: That the best
5 photograph I've ever seen, original photograph
6 of the auditorium exists in Eastern Long
7 Island Hospital on one of walls.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.

9 MS. BORRELLI: It's much -- it's an
10 original, it's one of the original photographs
11 of it without the Masonic Temple to its right
12 or anything, it's a really good photograph, if
13 we need to, you know, say need it.

14 THE CHAIRMAN: So there's a good
15 photograph of it at the Eastern Long Island
16 Hospital.

17 MS. BORRELLI: At the hospital,
18 yup.

19 MS. WINGATE: We can take a picture
20 of it.

21 MS. BORRELLI: Picture of the
22 picture.

23 THE CHAIRMAN: A picture of a
24 picture. Okay.

25 Item number five, motion to accept

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 the minutes of the September 11th and
3 October 2nd, 2017 meetings? All in favor?

4 MS. BORRELLI: Aye.

5 MR. McMAHON: Aye.

6 THE CHAIRMAN: Motion to schedule
7 the next HPC meeting for 5:00 p.m. on
8 December 4th, 2017 at the Third Street Fire
9 Station, all in favor?

10 MR. McMAHON: All in favor.

11 MS. BORRELLI: All in favor.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So what we
13 just discussed about item number four is we
14 are going to see if we can combine that with a
15 continuation event that evening.

16 MS. WINGATE: Here? This building?

17 THE CHAIRMAN: It could be here.
18 We'll found out if this space is available or
19 another space.

20 MS. WINGATE: Okay.

21 THE CHAIRMAN: First choice would
22 be this space because then we would be able to
23 assemble the public audience and that would be
24 here and we --

25 MS. BORRELLI: No -- I'm sorry, you

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2 said the fire department has something going
3 on?

4 THE CHAIRMAN: We don't know. They
5 raised the shutters there as if they were
6 gonna have dinner here soon.

7 MS. BORRELLI: Oh.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: I don't know.

9 MS. WINGATE: Well, there is a
10 table (Indicating).

11 THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah. Okay.

12 Motion to adjourn? All in favor?

13 MS. BORRELLI: Aye.

14 MR. McMAHON: Aye.

15 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

16 (Meeting adjourned 5:44 p.m.)
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1 HPC REGULAR MEETING 11/06/2017

2

3

CERTIFICATION

4

5

I, DONNA L. RITZMANN, a Notary Public in
and for the State of New York, do hereby certify:

6

7

THAT the foregoing is a true and accurate
transcript of my stenographic notes.

8

9

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my
hand this 17th day of November, 2013.

10

11

12

13

DONNA L. RITZMANN

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25